PROJECT MUSE®

Frances Cabrini, American Exceptionalism, and Returning to Rome



Kathleen Sprows Cummings

The Catholic Historical Review, Volume 104, Number 1, Winter 2018, pp. 1-22 (Article)

Published by The Catholic University of America Press
DOI: *https://doi.org/10.1353/cat.2018.0000*

For additional information about this article
https://muse.jhu.edu/article/691023

Access provided by American Catholic Historical Association (23 Apr 2018 18:16 GMT)



Kathleen Sprows Cummings
President
The American Catholic Historical Association
2017

(*Photo credit*: Department of American Studies, University of Notre Dame)

THE CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW

VOL. 104 **WINTER 2018** **NO. 1**

Frances Cabrini, American Exceptionalism, and Returning to Rome

KATHLEEN SPROWS CUMMINGS*

By analyzing Frances Cabrini as a canonized saint, a U.S. citizen, and an immigrant, this essay shows that American exceptionalism has shaped U.S. Catholic historiography as well as hagiography, and suggests that emphasizing the centrality of the Holy See to the American Catholic story can help historians consider U.S. Catholicism in local, national, and transnational registers. This essay also suggests that Cabrini's story can inspire a new generation of historians to integrate the approaches of several previous generations, by adopting a more expansive vision of the institutional Church that also includes the ordinary people who had little or no direct engagement with its structures.

Keywords: Frances Cabrini, saints, American Catholicism, canonization, women, missionary, Holy See

December 22, 2017, marked the centenary of the death of Frances Cabrini, a native of northern Italy, founder of the Missionary Sisters of the Sacred Heart of Jesus (M.S.C.), and the first U.S. citizen to be canonized a saint. The milestone inspired commemorations in the United States and in Italy, where Pope Francis was particularly effusive, praising Cabrini's courageous efforts to bring the love of Christ to those who had traveled far from home.[1] Francis' admiration for Cabrini predates his eleva-

*Kathleen Cummings is Director of the William W. and Anna Jean Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism and Associate Professor of American Studies and History, University of Notre Dame, email: kcumming@nd.edu. This article was delivered as the outgoing Presidential Address at the annual meeting of the American Catholic Historical Association, January 6, 2017, in Washington, D.C.

1. During his Angelus on World Day for Migrants and Refugees on January 15, 2017, Pope Francis remembered "the example of Saint Francesca *Cabrini*, patron of migrants, the

tion to the papacy, and, in fact, the former Cardinal Bergoglio's familiarity with Cabrini's congregation in Buenos Aires was one reason its members anticipated that he would include Cabrini's shrine in northern Manhattan on his itinerary during his 2015 trip to the United States.[2] The primary purpose of every papal trip is to "confirm the sisters and brothers in the faith," and the pope often seeks to accomplish this goal by referencing historical figures who combined a reputation for holiness with a resonance in the local culture.[3] Though Cabrini may have seemed a logical person for him to highlight, Francis did not visit her shrine, even though he was nearby; neither did he mention Cabrini at all during his sojourn in the United States. Far from a slight, this omission is instead a reminder of the importance of vantage points: like most Catholics born outside the United States, Pope Francis does not regard Cabrini as particularly "American."

Pope Francis may be correct in offering Cabrini as a model for confronting migration crises of the present. It is also true that Cabrini's life and "afterlife" can raise new questions about the past, especially that of the United States, the nation whose citizens have long claimed a special share in her saintly glory. Using three categories commonly assigned to Cabrini—canonized saint, U.S. citizen, and immigrant—this essay argues that American exceptionalism has shaped U.S. Catholic historiography as well as hagiography, and makes a case for contemporary historians to remedy this by recognizing, as the first historians of the U.S. church did reflexively, the centrality of the Holy See to the American Catholic story. Finally, in considering Cabrini as a Catholic woman, this essay suggests that her story can inspire a new generation of historians writing about U.S. Catholicism to

---

centenary of whose death occurs this year. This courageous Sister dedicated her life to bringing the love of Christ to those who were far from their native land and family. Her witness helps us to take care of the stranger, in whom Jesus is present, often suffering, rejected and humiliated." Pope Francis, "Angelus, 15 gennaio 2017," Vatican website, January 15, 2017. Retrieved on September 22, 2017, from http://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/it/angelus/2017/documents/papa-francesco_angelus_20170115.html; Hannah Brockhaus, "Mother Cabrini's care for immigrants remains relevant, Pope Francis says," Catholic News Agency, September 19, 2017. Retrieved on September 22, 2017, from http://www.catholicnewsagency.com/news/mother-cabrinis-care-for-immigrants-remains-relevant-pope-francis-says-59416.

2. Michael T. Luongo, "In Upper Manhattan, Restoring the Golden Halo of Mother Cabrini," *New York Times*, February 8, 2015. Retrieved on September 22, 2017, from https://www.nytimes.com/2015/02/08/nyregion/in-upper-manhattan-restoring-the-golden-halo-of-mother-cabrini.html.

3. John L. Allen Jr, "What Pope Francis is up to in Armenia over the weekend," *Crux*, June 22, 2016. Retrieved on September 22, 2017 from https://cruxnow.com/analysis/2016/06/22/what-pope-francis-is-up-to-in-armenia-over-the-weekend/.

integrate the approaches of several previous generations, by adopting a more expansive vision of the institutional Church that also includes the ordinary people who had little or no direct engagement with its formal structures.

We begin with the most exclusive of the categories into which Cabrini falls, that of a canonized saint. In the eyes of Catholic believers, this distinction reflects a truth about Cabrini's afterlife in a literal sense: by raising a candidate to the "honors of the altar," the church affirms that the saint, having practiced certain virtues to a heroic degree, passed immediately upon death into the company of God and all the saints. For historians, canonized saints also have figurative afterlives. Because holy men and women emerge in specific contexts, a study of canonization can reveal as much about the priorities and interests of the candidates' promoters as it does about the lives of the prospective saints themselves. Whereas scholars of early modern Europe have long appreciated saints' interpretive potential, historians of the modern period, and especially those of the Americas, have only recently begun to harness that potential—or, to borrow Simon Ditchfield's phrase, to "think with the saints."[4] While canonization may be fundamentally about holiness, it is never *only* about holiness, and in the United States, it was often about the ways in which Catholics defined, defended, and celebrated their identities as Americans. Though this essay primarily considers Cabrini's saintly story, it also references, albeit briefly, those attached to the five other U.S. causes for canonization that succeeded in the twentieth century. The collective afterlives of the first American saints reveal that, for the U.S. Catholic faithful, saints served as mediators not only between heaven and earth, but also between religion and American culture, and between the U.S. Church and the Holy See.

An excellent point of departure for a discussion of American exceptionalism and Cabrini's afterlife is the map of Cabrini's travels designed by

4. For examples of European studies, see Simon Ditchfield, "Thinking with the Saints: Sanctity and Society in Early Modern Europe," *Critical Inquiry* 35, no. 3 (Spring 2009), 552–84, and Peter Burke, "How to Be a Counter-Reformation Saint," in *The Reformation: Critical Concepts in Historical Studies,* vol. 4, ed. Andrew Pettegree (London, 2004), 153–64, here 162. There have been several excellent studies of devotion to non-American saints in the United States, including Robert Orsi's *Thank You St. Jude: Women's Devotion to the Patron Saint of Hopeless Causes* (New Haven, 1996) and Margaret McCormack's edited collection, *Saints and Their Cults in the Atlantic World* (Columbia, SC, 2007). There have also been several excellent studies of single causes for canonization, notably Allan Greer, *Mohawk Saint: Catherine Tekakwitha and the Jesuits* (New York, 2005); Celia Cussen, *Black Saint of the Americas* (New York, 2014); and Emma Anderson, *The Death and Afterlife of the North American Martyrs* (Cambridge, MA, 2013).



FIGURE 1. Mother Antoinetta Della Casa, Carta geographica, "*Distanze percorse dalla Serva di Dio F.S. Cabrini nei suoi viaggi di terra e di mare*," 271–72, in *Frances Cabrini's Ordinary Process in Chicago on Fame of Sanctity, 1928*, 5636, Cong. Riti, ASV. Credit: Vatican Secret Archives

her successor, Mother Antonietta della Casa (Figure 1). Della Casa submitted the map to the Sacred Congregation of Rites, the Vatican dicastery charged with overseeing canonization, for the purpose of introducing Cabrini's cause in 1928. Gold-embossed dots mark the sixty-seven foundations Cabrini established on three continents between her first Atlantic crossing in 1889 and her final one in 1912.[5] According to all accounts of

5. M. Antonietta Della Cassa, Sup. Generale Missionarie del S. Cuore [Superior General of the Missionaries of the Sacred Heart], Carta geographica [map], "Distanze percorse dalla Serva di Dio F.S. Cabrini nei suoi viaggi di terra e di mare," 5636, Vatican Secret

Cabrini's life, those golden dots appeared in places very different from those she had envisioned during her childhood in northern Italy, when, having learned from visiting missionaries about the unevangelized peoples of Asia, she had dreamed of bringing the gospel to them. After founding the M.S.C.s, she had knelt at the altar of St. Francis Xavier at Rome's Church of the Gesù and vowed to travel with her sisters to China (Figure 2). By the late 1880s, however, at the urging of Giovanni Battista Scalabrini, bishop of Piacenza in Northern Italy, Cabrini began to consider going instead to the United States to serve the rapidly growing population of Italians living there. New York's Archbishop Michael Corrigan also prevailed upon Cabrini to help alleviate the desperate working and living conditions of Italian immigrants, who suffered from a shortage of Italian-speaking priests and nuns to staff parishes and schools.

On the tenth anniversary of Cabrini's death, Monsignor Carlo Salotti, a lawyer at the Sacred Congregation of Rites, offered a standard account of what happened next. Cabrini, Salotti maintained, found Scalabrini's and Corrigan's arguments compelling, but felt torn. Wondering whether she should abandon her plan to go to East Asia, "where millions of infidels awaited the light of redemption," Cabrini appealed to Pope Leo XIII for guidance. The pope, moved by "the sad picture of a vast multitude of abandoned Italians" in America, spoke plainly: "Not to the East, but to the West!" According to Salotti, the moment Cabrini heard these words, she "hesitated no more." The pope's command would later find its way into most biographical sketches of Cabrini, with authors imparting varying degrees of reluctance or resignation to Cabrini when it came to letting go of her China dreams.[6]

Ubiquitous as this vignette has become, it controverts considerable evidence that by the time Cabrini met with Pope Leo, she had already made a firm decision in favor of New York. She had begun taking instruction in English earlier that fall and had even booked her passage. She later recounted that her answer had come after a second moment of private

---

Archives, Sacred Congregation of Rites, Vatican City. Map is in full color and inserted between 271 and 272 of *Processus Ordinaria Autoritate Chicagien, super fama sanctitatis virtutem Servae Dei Franciscae Xaverio Cabrini Anno 1928*.

6. Salotti's address was published as a preface to Mother Saverio De Maria, *Madre Francesca Cabrini* (Turin, 1927). For other examples of accounts of Cabrini "abandoning" her dreams of China, see *To the Ends of the Earth: The Missionary Travels of Frances X. Cabrini,* trans. Philippa Provenzano, M.S.C. (New York, NY, 2001), xvii, and Edward V. Dailey, *The Citizen Saint: The Life and Miracles of Saint Frances Xavier Cabrini* (Chicago, 1947), no pagination (Chapter III, "Expansion").

prayer in the Gesù. Cabrini, it appears, had sought Leo's blessing rather than his instruction.[7]

As with many other stories attached to Catholic saints, the point of this one is not necessarily its veracity, but the frequency with which it is told and the purposes it has served. The assertion that Leo himself had sent her to the United States gave Cabrini an important source of authority in her lifetime. When Cabrini arrived in New York City in 1889, for example, Corrigan ordered her to return to Italy, because the benefaction he had promised her had not materialized. Cabrini refused, insisting that because the Holy Father had sent her to New York, she would remain until he told her otherwise. Apparently unaccustomed to being defied, the archbishop, according to one witness of the exchange, "grew red in the face and then became very quiet," but he allowed her to stay.[8] The story also became extremely important in American historical memory, buttressing as it did U.S. Catholics' insistence that they had a unique connection to Cabrini. As Chicago's Catholic newspaper declared at the time of her beatification in 1938, this papally-mandated diversion had ensured that Cabrini would "work out her destiny not among pagodas, but skyscrapers."[9]

Jesuit John LaFarge, editor of *America* magazine, paid a number of tributes to Cabrini in which he emphasized the strong bond between Cabrini and U.S. Catholics. LaFarge had preached his first retreat to Cabrini and her sisters at the congregation's convent in West Park, New York, in 1906, and delivered the English sermon during her funeral Mass there on a frigid morning in early January 1918. On that occasion, LaFarge and the other priests participating in the ritual had briefly considered foregoing the customary Requiem Mass in favor of a Mass of Thanksgiving, as the mourners had been "overwhelmingly" convinced that there was no need to pray that Cabrini would be taken to Heaven, so certain were they

---

7. Mary Louise Sullivan, *Mother Cabrini: Italian Immigrant of the Century* (New York, 1998), 45. Cabrini's momentous audience with Leo did not take place during her first visit to Rome in 1887, as Dailey suggests in *Citizen Saint*. In a letter written in October 1888 she refers to not being able to get an audience with him despite all the support from various members of the hierarchy. She grew more confident by December of that year; the audience took place in early January 1889. See Missionary Sisters of the Sacred Heart, *Epistolario di Santa Francesca Saverio Cabrini* [Letters of Saint Frances Cabrini] *(1868–1917)*, October 1, 1888, 369; December 19, 1888, 398; December 21, 1888, 401; and January 17, 1889, 413, which refers to the audience the week before. I am grateful to Maria Williams for helping me piece this chronology together.

8. Quoted in Sullivan, *Mother Cabrini*, 79.

9. "Zeal for Souls Motivated Mother Cabrini's Life Work," *Chicago New World,* November 18, 1938, 2.



FIGURE 2. Photo of Frances Cabrini in 1880, the year in which she founded the Missionary Sisters of the Sacred Heart of Jesus (M.S.C.). Cabrini appears in the original habit of the Missionary Sisters. Photo provided courtesy of the Archives of the Institute of the Missionary Sisters of the Sacred Heart of Jesus in Radnor, Pennsylvania.

that she was already there. Having been the first to acknowledge Cabrini as a citizen of heaven, LaFarge later suggested, U.S. Catholics deserved "an extra share" in her heavenly intercession.[10]

More than any other factor, however, it was Cabrini's U.S. citizenship that gave LaFarge and other U.S. Catholics license to celebrate both her beatification and her canonization as their own national triumphs. Here again, the facts are not at issue: Cabrini had indeed applied for and received U.S. citizenship in Seattle in 1909. She herself never disclosed her reasons for seeking naturalization. In all likelihood, she had been following the advice of her lawyer, as U.S. citizenship not only helped Cabrini secure the congregation's property holdings but also facilitated her frequent border

10. John LaFarge, S.J., "Mother Cabrini's Requiem," *America*, July 6, 1946, 304; *idem*, "Blessed Frances Cabrini: Citizen of the United States," *America*, November 12, 1938, 124–25.

crossings.[11] Cabrini's admirers in the United States, however, readily imputed other motives to Cabrini's declaration of allegiance to the American flag: having become "so enamored of America," they insisted, she "fully realized how her work could identify itself with the great destinies of the new world."[12] According to Chicago's Cardinal George Mundelein, Cabrini had viewed naturalization as a way "to link her institutions more firmly to the country."[13] One biographer explained that while Cabrini "had from the outset intended to seek naturalization," the practical demands of running the congregation had prevented her from doing so for two decades."[14]

After 1933 Cabrini's cause found an important champion in the newly-appointed apostolic delegate to the United States, Amleto Cicognani. Although Cicognani acknowledged that some Europeans might view it as "rather presumptuous that a young nation should seek to have its own [causes] of beatification and canonization," he considered it his mandate to secure a saint from the United States.[15] So eager was Cicognani to present Cabrini as a U.S. saint that he occasionally stretched the truth to prove that she "had reserved special love for the United States." When he cited, for example, the fact that she had spent the last five years of her life within U.S. boundaries, he neglected to mention the practical factors—namely, Cabrini's ill health and the outbreak of World War I—that had kept her from returning to Italy. In one of his first acts as apostolic delegate, Cicognani authorized Cabrini's exhumation from West Park and reinterment at the congregation's convent in Upper Manhattan, a location both more visible and more accessible to pilgrims.[16] It was also Cicognani who applied on Cabrini's behalf for a dispensation from the canonical stipulation that the church allow fifty years to pass after a candidate's death before beginning an official investigation into the candidate's "heroic virtues."[17] This

11. Sullivan, *Mother Cabrini,* 246.

12. *Ibid.*, 246.

13. "Cardinal Mundelein's Address," *New York Times*, November 14, 1938, 9.

14. J.B. Lux, "Chicago's First Saint," *Extension* 33, no. 6 (1938), 13–14, 18, here 13; Dailey, epilogue to *Citizen Saint,* no pagination; Theodore Maynard, *Too Small a World: The Life of Francesca Cabrini* (Milwaukee, 1945), 298.

15. Amleto Cicognani, *Sanctity in America* (Paterson, 1939), 2.

16. "Account of Exhumation Cabrini's body 10-3-1993 and newspaper clippings," File H, Folder 14(b), Cabrini University Archive, Cabriniana Room (hereafter CR-CU), Radnor, PA; "Letter: Cicognani to Sisters about Exhumation of S.F.X. Cabrini 10-19-33—other correspondence," File H, Folder 14(c), CR-CU, trans. by author.

17. Amleto Giovanni Cicognani to Rev ma. Antonietta Della Casa, "Letter: Cicognani to Sisters," in "Beatification & Canonization Process," 10 giugno 1935, File H, Folder 14(c), CR-CU, trans. by author.

dispensation was one factor that allowed Cabrini's beatification process to break "all modern records" for speed.[18]

Nevertheless Cabrini's cause had not moved quickly enough to overtake that of the North American martyrs, eight French missionaries who had perished in New France in the 1640s and whose causes for canonization had been initiated before Cabrini had even arrived in the United States. Meeting at the Third Plenary Council of Baltimore in 1884, the U.S. bishops had written a petition to Leo XIII "humbly begging" that the causes of two of the men, René Goupil and Isaac Jogues, be considered so as to "afford native patrons" for the United States. News of the "first step ever" in proposing a U.S. cause had been welcomed by many of the faithful who, according to historian John Gilmary Shea, had longed for a canonized saint who "lived and labored and sanctified themselves in *our* land, among circumstances familiar."[19] Shea and other North American Catholics had begun to complain that by 1870, seventeen men and women from Central and South America had been recognized as saints by the Church, whereas not a single person from Canada or the United States was even being considered for the honor. "Without monarchs or wealthy communities to undertake the long and often expensive investigations demanded at Rome," one American Catholic grumbled, it was no wonder that "no servant of God who lived or labored . . . in any part of our continent lying north of the Rio Grande" had ever even been proposed for canonization.[20]

U.S. Catholics' desire for a canonized saint of their own had reflected, in part, a desire to strengthen the bonds of attachment between themselves and the Holy See, and to move from their classification as a precarious "mission territory" operating under *Propaganda Fide* to an organized, self-sustaining church on par with Catholicism in European countries. Pursuing a saint of their own helped reinforce this emerging national identity. Practically, the quest proved that the Church had the necessary financial and institutional wherewithal to sponsor a cause; symbolically, the effort implied that uniquely American expressions of holiness were tantamount

18. Lux, "Chicago's First Saint," 4; Rev. Rupert Dorn, O.F.M., "New Missioner Saint," *Catholic Mission Digest* 4, no. 8 (1946), 14–16, here 16.

19. John Gilmary Shea, "Holy Personages of Canada and the United States whose Canonization is Begun," *Ave Maria* 30 (1890), 100-23, 129–32, 145–48, 179–83, here 100. Emphasis added.

20. "The Venerable Mother Mary of the Incarnation," *Catholic World* 27 (1878), 608-26, here 608.

to those manifest in European countries where nationalism and sanctity had long been intertwined.[21]

The relationship between saint-seeking and nation-building was less straightforward in the United States, where Catholicism had long been a controversial minority religion, than it was in places such as Italy or France. Anti-Catholic sentiment was particularly virulent in the 1880s. The increase in migration from southern and eastern Europe that had created a pastoral crisis for Corrigan and other U.S. bishops had also magnified the Catholic menace in the minds of U.S. Protestants. These newcomers were suspect not only because of their supposed allegiance to Rome, but also because of their overwhelming concentration in urban areas and industrial occupations. Shea and other U.S. Catholics believed that opening causes for canonization of Goupil and Jogues would help diminish anti-Catholicism by showing that their religious roots in North America stretched back into the colonial period. An American saint, in other words, could potentially provide a double model, one that would both convince the Holy See that holiness had flourished on U.S. soil and persuade skeptical Protestants that Catholics, by virtue of their long-standing presence in North America, could be loyal American citizens.[22]

By the time of their canonization in 1930, however, Jogues and Goupil were no longer perceived by U.S. Catholics as the most effective symbols of Catholics' Americanness. That the Jesuit martyrs "had offered their lives for the Indians long before the United States was conceived," according to one U.S. priest, limited their national significance.[23] Pointing out that none of the martyred Jesuits had ever become "a naturalized citizen of the United States," saint-seekers vowed to "do all we can to promote the causes of those who have lived and died in *our* country." As U.S. Catholics redirected their search for a saint of their own, now focused on holy people who had labored "under the stars and stripes," Cabrini emerged as the new preferred candidate.[24]

---

21. For one recent study, see Erin Rowe, *Saint and Nation: Santiago, Teresa of Ávila, and Plural Identities in Early Modern Spain* (University Park, PA, 2011).

22. For an excellent analysis of how this dynamic applied in the case of Tekakwitha, see Allan Greer, "Natives and Nationalism: The Americanization of Kateri Tekakwitha," *The Catholic Historical Review* 90, no. 2 (2004), 260–72. See also chapter one of my forthcoming book, *Citizen Saints: Catholics and Canonization in the United States.*

23. Lux, "Chicago's First Saint," 18.

24. Michael Lyons, S.J., "Saints of the United States," *St. Anthony Messenger* 35 (1927), 188-89, 201, here 188; Rev. Charles Souvay, "Cause," RG 1-3-5-8, Archives of the Daughters of Charity, Emmitsburg, MD; "Word of Superiors," *The Echo of the Motherhouse*, January 1935; M.E. Clemens, "On the Hill of the Martyrs," *America*, October 17, 1925, 13–14, here 14; Lux, "Chicago's First Saint," 13.

Cabrini was canonized in July 1946, again having moved with record speed through the final stage of the process. Presiding at his first canonization Mass since before World War II, Pope Pius XII urged "nations and peoples" to learn from the new saint "that they are called to constitute a single family, which must not be divided in ambiguous and stormy rivalry nor dissolve itself in eternal hostilities."[25] U.S. Catholics ignored the pontiff and celebrated Cabrini's canonization with an exuberance that appalled some overseas observers. One Irish priest, for instance, chided U.S. Catholics for trying to Americanize a woman who had just been affirmed as a citizen of heaven. "Chicago and New York boast that she was their citizen," he wrote, but Americans had forgotten that "she sought for a city that is to come."[26] Some U.S. Catholics did gesture to the primacy of Cabrini's heavenly citizenship. *Commonweal's* editors, for example, reminded readers that dwelling on the glory that Cabrini's canonization bestowed on the American flag would be "a back-front approach": the achievement honored God, not the United States. Yet even they could not contain their jubilation: the same editorial described Cabrini's canonization as the "most honorable event in American history." Although other saints and blesseds of "what is now the United States may have sanctified our soil," Cabrini was "an American citizen and so an American saint of a new kind."[27] The following week, *Commonweal* published a review of a new biography of Cabrini that criticized the book for, among other flaws, containing "no account—indeed no mention—of her naturalization, or of the reasons that prompted her to take this step."[28]

Cabrini's interpreters outside the United States, by contrast, regarded American citizenship as ancillary to her story. To Carlo Salotti, the lawyer from the Sacred Congregation who had become its prefect by the time of Cabrini's beatification, Cabrini had been an "illustrious daughter" of Italy who happened to have died in the United States.[29] Cabrini's first biographer, an Italian member of her congregation, never even mentioned her naturalization as a U.S. citizen, and many others remembered her primarily

---

25. Pope Pius XII, "Homilia Sanctissimi Domini Nostri," in "In Sollemni Canonizatione Beatae Franciscae Cabrini, Virginis, In Basilica Vaticana die VII mensis Iulii a. MDCCCXXXXVI Peracta," (August 1, 1946), *Acta Apostolicae Sedis* 38 (1946), 269–73, here 273.

26. Donal O'Sullivan, "St. Frances Xavier Cabrini: Canonised July 7 [sic] 1946," *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review* 35, no. 139 (1946), 351–56, here 351.

27. "St. Frances Xavier Cabrini," *Commonweal*, July 19, 1946, 325.

28. Anne Fremantle, "Sacred and Profane Success," *Commonweal*, July 27, 1945, 360–62, here 361.

29. Salotti, "Preface," in Mother Saverio de Maria, *Mother Frances Xavier Cabrini*, trans. Rose Basile Green (Chicago, 1983), 15–19, here 18.

as "*una grande italiana*."[30] And then, of course, there is Mother Antonietta's map. In depicting the United States as but one part of a triangle, it presents a different perspective than the mental map of U.S. Catholics, in which Cabrini is firmly oriented to a U.S. center.

Cabrini's real center of gravity—the most pivotal gold dot on that map, as it were—was Rome, the place she deliberately returned to again and again. Cabrini explained her reasons for doing so in a 1912 meeting with Philadelphia's Mother Katharine Drexel, who had established a religious congregation of sisters in 1891 but was having difficulty obtaining approval from the Holy See. Drexel would also become a candidate for canonization, and her hagiographers would later imagine the visit as a union of two "kindred spirits . . . on fire with zeal for souls."[31] At the time, though, the meeting must have seemed to Drexel less an ethereal encounter than a practical opportunity to learn from a seasoned superior. Explaining how things worked at the Holy See, Cabrini told Drexel: "You see, it is like this. You get a lot of mail every day. Some of it you must take care of immediately. Other items are important but you put them on the shelf to take care of tomorrow. Then tomorrow, something else demanding attention comes in and you leave the other letter still on the shelf. Before you know it, there are a lot of other items before it. It is like that in Rome. Things get shelved even though they are important. If you want to get your Rule approved, you go yourself to Rome and take it with you."[32] Drexel followed Cabrini's advice, went to Rome, and gained approval the next year.

Over the course of her own extended stays in Rome, Cabrini had acquired influential allies at the Holy See. Monsignor Giacomo della Chiesa, for example, had been working at the Holy See's Secretariat of State in 1889 when he supplied Cabrini with crucial letters of introduction to U.S. bishops. They would maintain sporadic contact until 1914, when

30. See, for examples, her obituaries titled "Una grande italiana," by A. Grossi-Grondi in *L'Osservatore Romano* and by Maddelena Patrizi in *Il Bollettino dell'Unione fra le Donne Cattoliche d'Italia,* reprinted in *In Memoria della Rev.ma Madre Francesca Saverio Cabrini, Fondatrice e Superiora Generale delle Missionarie del S. Cuore di Gesù, volata al Cielo in Chicago, il 22 Diciembre 1917* [In Memory of Reverend Mother Frances Saverio Cabrini, Founder and Superior General of the Missonaries of the Sacred Heart of Jesus, gone to Heaven in Chicago December 22, 1917] (New York, 1918).

31. *Canonizationis Servae Dei Catharinae Mariae Drexel, Fundatricis Congregationis, Sororum AAS. Sacramento Pro Indis et Colorata Gente (1858–1955) Vol. I: Exposito Historica et Documenta* (Rome, 1986), 733, Saint Katharine Drexel Canonization Files, 1992.013, *Philadelphien.* Catholic Historical Research Center of the Archdiocese of Philadelphia (hereafter CHRCAP), Germantown, PA.

32. *Ibid.*, 733–34.

della Chiesa was elected to succeed Pope Pius X. Cabrini was "most happy" to hear of her friend's election, and her congregation received "many benefits" from the man now called Pope Benedict XV.[33] The pontiff was merely the highest-ranking among the hundreds of church leaders who sent condolences after Cabrini's death. As Seattle's Archbishop Edward John O'Dea observed, Cabrini had "counted among her friends [the] members of the highest hierarchy of the Church, the most eminent Cardinals, and the best known prelates."[34]

Though Cabrini's Roman connections, and her ability to use them for the benefit of her congregation, were often cited as testaments to her ingenuity, they did occasionally engender resentment. Rev. Henry Malak, for example, developed a grudge against Cabrini while he was promoting the cause for canonization of the Polish-born Mother Theresa (née Josephine) Dudzik, a contemporary of Cabrini in Chicago. Unlike Dudzik, who, Malak pointed out, had arrived on American soil as "an unknown immigrant girl" and relied on God alone to build her congregation in the United States, Cabrini had come to the United States "wearing a religious habit, in company with a group of Sisters, armed with the personal recommendations from Pope Leo XIII, from Cardinals and Bishops" that had "opened doors and loosened diocesan purse strings for her."[35]

Malak's observation is not atypical in causes for canonization, which often incite a decidedly unsaintly spirit of competition among petitioners. But he had a point. Traveling as a missionary is arguably quite different from traveling as an immigrant, and Cabrini *had* been a missionary, according to canon law and her own self-understanding. In fact, Cabrini had struggled mightily to get canonical approval to use the feminine form of "missionary" (*missionarie*) in her congregation's name, as only one female congregation had so incorporated it before."[36] By the

33. Quoted in Mother Saverio de Maria, *Mother Frances Xavier Cabrini,* 241.

34. Pope Benedict XV's and O'Dea's eulogies were among those included in a remarkable, 478-page, multi-lingual volume published by della Casa. The ostensible purpose of the commemorative book was to comfort Cabrini's daughters and to testify to the legacy she had left around the world, but it was also likely that della Casa was laying the foundation for a cause for canonization on Cabrini's behalf. *In Memoria della Rev.ma Madre Francesca Saverio Cabrini, Fondatrice e Superiora Generale delle Missionarie del S. Cuore di Gesù, volata al Cielo in Chicago, il 22 Diciembre 1917* [In Memory of Reverend Mother Frances Saverio Cabrini, Founder and Superior General of the Missonaries of the Sacred Heart of Jesus, gone to Heaven in Chicago December 22, 1917] (New York, 1918).

35. Rev. Henry Malak, *Theresa of Chicago* (Lemont, IL, 1975), 113.

36. Cited in Sullivan, *Mother Cabrini*, 36.

1930s, however, any distinction between those two categories disappeared in accounts of Cabrini's life as U.S. Catholics hailed her as an appropriate "national heroine" for a country filled with "immigrants or children of immigrants" and began to publish biographies of her under the title of "Immigrant Saint."[37] In 1952, the American Committee on Italian Migration proclaimed Cabrini the "Italian immigrant of the century," and her most recent U.S. biographer, Mary Louise Sullivan, M.S.C., adopted that phrase as the subtitle of the book. In her appendix, Sullivan translated the 1950 papal brief that declared Cabrini "*la patrona degli emigranti*" into "patroness of immigrants." This mistranslation, which is common in U.S., though not British, English, was not a mistake—Sullivan was fluent in Italian—but another reflection of the ways in which the lens of American exceptionalism has shaped the way Cabrini's story is told in the United States.[38]

The question of whether Cabrini is best labeled as an immigrant or an emigrant has been rendered moot by the now-preferred use of "migrant" as an umbrella term. A much more provocative question is the extent to which her assigned immigrant status contributed to Cabrini's widespread appeal in the United States in the 1930s and 1940s. An instructive contrast, for example, can be made between Cabrini's beatification and one that occurred two years after hers: that of Philippine Duchesne, a French-born member of the Society of the Sacred Heart who had worked as a missionary in Missouri from 1818 until her death in 1852. Like Goupil and Jogues, Duchesne had emerged in the 1880s as one of the first prospective U.S. saints. As had been the case with the Jesuit martyrs, Duchesne's candidacy arose out of U.S. Catholics' desire to resolve what they saw as a disparity between their own saint-deprived culture and a saint-saturated culture to their south. Hailing Duchesne as the putative "St. Rose of Missouri for these United States," Susan Emery presented the French missionary as a rejoinder to Rose of Lima, who had been canonized in 1671 as the first saint from the Americas. Considering that the Rose of Missouri and the Rose of Lima had met the same "European standards of sanctity," Emery argued, it was no longer justifiable for the former to languish as an "uncanonized saint."[39]

---

37. E.g. Pietro Donato, *Immigrant Saint: The Life of Mother Cabrini* (New York, 1960).

38. Sullivan, *Mother Cabrini*, 285–86. For an example of a British use of title, see Maria Williams, "Mobilising Mother Cabrini's educational practice: the transnational context of the London school of the Missionary Sisters of the Sacred Heart of Jesus 1898–1911," *Journal of the History of Education Society* 44, no. 5 (2015), 631–50.

39. S. L. Emery, "Mother Duchesne, R.S.H., An Uncanonized American Saint," *Catholic World,* August 1897, 687–94.

Duchesne's cause had proceeded at a more predictable pace than Cabrini's had done, and as a result both women's causes were being evaluated in Rome in the 1930s. This coincidence invited frequent comparisons between the two women, which invariably emphasized that they had undertaken "different kinds of work in the New World" against remarkably different backdrops. Whereas Duchesne had inhabited "a log cabin" in a "crude village," Cabrini's hagiographical keywords were *city* and *skyscraper*.[40] Duchesne's admirers praised her as "frontierswoman" who had willingly become an exile in "a far-off country to be a light bearer to savage races who dwelt in darkness."[41] Cabrini, by contrast, had been "mother and solace" to immigrants in the United States, the country which she had embraced wholeheartedly.[42]

As an urban, immigrant saint, Cabrini evoked a sense of proximity among U.S. Catholics in a way Duchesne did not. Chronologically, Duchesne may have belonged to the nineteenth century, but figuratively she was best understood as a peer of the seventeenth-century North American martyrs. As a result U.S. Catholics responded to Duchesne's beatification with a detached nonchalance that prompted an Irish Jesuit to upbraid U.S. Catholics for their lack of interest in "the splendid heroism of Philippine Duchesne." In what was undoubtedly wishful thinking, he urged them to put aside the bestselling *Gone with the Wind* and pick up a new history of the Society of the Sacred Heart. Duchesne's adventures, he insisted, were comparable to Scarlet O'Hara's in their "elements of romance and heroism."[43]

Much like the Jesuit martyrs, Duchesne had first been proposed for canonization in the 1880s, when missionaries were indisputably the heroes of the American Catholic story. But by the time she and Cabrini were beatified, urban immigrants occupied center stage (Figure 3). Few statements expressed more clearly the vicissitudes in U.S. Catholics' saintly expectations over the course of half a century than Rev. Joseph Code's

---

40. "Two Americans May Be Added to Catholic Saints," *The Springfield Sunday Union and Republican*, March 6, 1938, 6A; "Sainthood Urged for 2 Nuns Who Worked Long in America: Mothers Duchesne and Cabrini Proclaimed Worthy of Veneration in Catholic Church," *Daily Boston Globe*, March 6, 1938, B40; "Causes of Mother Cabrini, Mother Duchesne Advance," *Catholic Action of the South*, June 23, 1938, 1, 5.

41. John J. Glennon, "Introduction," in Marjory Erskine, *Mother Philippine Duchesne*, (New York, 1926), vii; Gilbert J. Garraghan, "Holiness on the Frontier," *Thought* 15, no. 2 (1940), 203–5, here 203.

42. Maynard, *Too Small a World*, 298.

43. Francis Shaw, S.J., "Some Heroines: Fact and Fiction," *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review* 27 (1938), 623–36, here 627.



FIGURE 3. Robert Smith, "Saint among the Skyscrapers," oil painting. Image used with permission of Cabrini University.

1946 assessment of "the American contribution to universal holiness," in which he characterized the Church in the United States as "an extension of Old World Catholicism." Code distinguished the U.S. Church from its counterparts in Africa and Asia, in which, he argued, the Church had sprung from the conversion of native people. In the United States, by contrast, the indigenous population had been almost incidental to the church's progress. "Even if every Red Man had been converted and had remained faithful," Code observed, "the effect would have been meager in the face of the millions of Catholics who came from Europe."[44] By the time Cabrini was canonized, in other words, urban Catholic immigrants were no longer the unsavory element that had alarmed Catholics and Protestants alike. They had become the linchpin of the American church.

44. Code, "The Contribution of Europe to Holiness in America," in *Miscellanea historica in honorem Alberti de Meyer Universitatis catholicae oppido lovaniensi iam annos XXV professoris* (Leuven, 1946), 1217–36, here 1218.

The tendency to foreground immigrants over missionaries in American hagiography was replicated in historiography. Cabrini's canonization coincided with the beginning of a trend in which historians of the U.S. Church began to adopt nationalist frames. Unlike members of previous scholarly generations, who had usually been clerics or members of religious congregations who had studied in Europe or had close connections there, these historians were not conversant in multiple languages, less interested in the transatlantic flows of people, ideas, devotions, and beliefs, and more inclined to limit their subjects to what transpired within U.S. boundaries. By the 1960s and 70s, U.S. Catholic historians were, in the main, much less interested in exploring the relationship between the U.S. Church and the Holy See and therefore less inclined to consult Roman archival repositories. There were, of course, exceptions to this rule. Foremost among them was Gerald P. Fogarty, S.J., who provided an enduring model of how to use Roman archives to illuminate the American Catholic experience.[45]

A more representative example, however, was Jay P. Dolan. The preeminent historian of his generation, Dolan emphasized the autonomy of the U.S. Church both in his pioneering study of New York's Irish and German Catholics and in his survey of the American Catholic experience. In the latter, Dolan allowed that "every generation of historians seeks to rediscover the past in a new and enlightening manner," and explained that his questions arose from both the "new understanding of the church" proclaimed at the Second Vatican Council and the emergence of the new social history. Dolan's emphasis "on the people and not just the prelates" led to an ingenious retelling of the American Catholic experience narrated "from the bottom up." But this approach left little room for exploration of the Vatican's influence on the American story. As for the men and women who traveled to the United States under the aegis of the Holy See before 1908, when the Holy See ceased classifying it as "mission territory," they largely disappeared as protagonists in a story organized around "the immigrant church."[46]

Cabrini's life story prompts us to acknowledge that the European missionaries who traveled to the United States in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries were not merely a subset of immigrants, but an alto-

---

45. See, for example, Fogarty's *The Vatican and the American Hierarchy* (Stuttgart, 1982). There were other scholars, many of whom were also ordained or members of a religious community, who consulted Roman sources.

46. Jay P. Dolan, *The American Catholic Experience: A History from Colonial Times to the Present* (Notre Dame, IN, 1992, originally published Garden City, New York, 1985), 9, 10; Jay P. Dolan, *The Immigrant Church: New York's Irish and German Catholics, 1815–1865* (Notre Dame, IN, 1975).

gether different category. Recognizing the difference as substantive rather than semantic would require historians to reclassify not only prominent historical figures like Cabrini and John Neumann (another missionary-turned-immigrant American saint) but the thousands of men and women who left Ireland, Poland, Germany, or elsewhere either already members of religious communities or for the purpose of joining them. Such an endeavor might well result in a re-mapping of nineteenth-century U.S. Catholicism, in which diocesan boundaries might appear more prominently than state lines. Such maps, which would replicate those that often appeared in Catholic almanacs of the period, would reflect more accurately the experience of Catholic missionaries, for whom the diocesan see mattered far more than the state capital.[47] Re-imagining the geography of U.S. Catholicism with diocesan boundaries as an organizing principle would not only shift its epicenter further away from the urban northeast, a region that continues to be overrepresented in historical scholarship, but would also mandate greater attention to the entity responsible for doing the organizing, the Holy See. As such, it would be of a piece with an emerging body of scholarship that emphasizes the importance of Roman sources for the study of Catholicism in the United States and throughout the world.[48]

Distinguishing between immigrants and missionaries would also help historians to consider U.S. Catholicism in local, national, Roman, and transnational registers. Like immigrants, missionaries may have also traveled from one country to another, but traveling under the auspices of *Propaganda Fide* meant that their stories unfolded not along an axis, but a triangle. As one of three vertices on that triangle, the Holy See was always present and must always be included in their stories—even if the missionaries did not go there themselves as often as Cabrini did, or indeed ever, as most did not, especially if they were women. This observation points to one potential danger in re-integrating Rome into the American Catholic story.

---

47. I am very grateful to Steven Avella for sharing with me his research-in-progress on Catholicism in the West, including the maps he has created of diocesan boundaries. Avella is another exception among U.S. Catholic historians in that he has long utilized Roman sources.

48. See, for example, Peter D'Agostino, *Rome in America: Transnational Catholic Ideology from the* Risorgimento *to Fascism* (Chapel Hill, 2004); John T. McGreevy, *American Jesuits and the World: How an Embattled Religious Order Made Modern Catholicism Global* (Princeton, 2016); Colin Barr, *Ireland's Empire: The Roman Catholic Church in the English-speaking World, 1830–1914* (New York, forthcoming); Matteo Binasco, *Roman Sources for the Study of American Catholicism, 1763–1939*, ed. Kathleen Sprows Cummings, (Notre Dame, IN, forthcoming). The guide contains inventories of fifty-nine archival repositories at the Vatican and throughout Rome that have relevant sources for the study of U.S. Catholicism.

During the initial phase of Katharine Drexel's cause for canonization, one U.S. bishop testified that the Philadelphia founder had been obedient to church authority, unlike Cabrini, who had "fought with every bishop along the line."[49] Cabrini certainly had been a force to be reckoned with, as Corrigan and others discovered, but the exceptional power she had as a woman in the Church derived less from her personality than from the access she had at the Vatican. Even when Drexel went to Rome, as Cabrini had urged her to do, she had had to work through a Redemptorist priest. And when Drexel's cause for canonization was opened in 1964, it was the Philadelphia Redemptorists sponsoring John Neumann's cause, rather than Drexel's own spiritual daughters, who presented it to the Sacred Congregation, as canon law stipulated that women could not serve as petitioners but needed to work through male proxies.[50]

This unexamined provision in the history of sanctity very nearly derailed the cause for canonization of Elizabeth Ann Bayley Seton. Born in 1774 into an Episcopal family in New York, Seton converted to Catholicism as a widowed mother of five and later founded the Sisters of Charity, the first Catholic women's religious community established in the United States without formal ties to a European congregation. Seton, who died in Emmitsburg, Maryland, in 1821, is today the only U.S. Catholic saint who can rival Cabrini in terms of prominence on the contemporary American landscape. Pope Francis' 2015 visit, in fact, arguably cemented Seton's status as an iconic American. Not only did Pope Francis reference Seton in his homily at St. Patrick's Cathedral, but President Obama also presented the pope with the key to Seton's Emmitsburg home as the official welcoming gift.[51]

---

49. Testimony of Most Reverend Joseph McShea, (retired bishop of Allentown), May 4, 1981, Saint Katharine Drexel Canonization Files, 1992.013, CHRCAP, Philadelphia, reprinted in *Philadelphien. Canonizationis Servae Daie Catharinae Mariae Drexel, Fundatricis Congregationis, Sororum A SS. Sacramento Pro Indis et Colorata Gente (1858–1955) Vol. II Summarium Depositionum Testium* (Rome, 1986), 228.

50. Canon law had made this prohibition explicit, stipulating that petitioners could "act personally or through a procurator legitimately constituted for this; women [cannot act] except through a procurator." Edward N. Peters, curator, *The 1917 Pio-Benedictine Code of Canon Law, in English translation with extensive Scholarly Apparatus* (San Francisco, 2001), no. 2004, 648.

51. Dee Gallo, "Unlocking the archival legalities of donating the Seton key," Daughters of Charity Archives, September 28, 2015. Retrieved on September 22, 2017 from https://dcarchives.wordpress.com/2015/09/28/unlocking-the-archival-legalities-of-donating-the-seton-key/; "Homily of his Holiness Pope Francis," Vatican website, September 24, 2015. Retrieved on September 26, 2016 from https://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/ homilies/2015/documents/papa-francesco_20150924_usa-omelia-vespri-nyc.html. Pope Francis also mentioned John Neumann in the same homily.

Seton's cause for canonization was the first one shepherded exclusively by U.S. Catholics. Like the North American martyrs and Philippine Duchesne, Seton had first been nominated for sainthood in the 1880s. U.S. saint-seeking inexperience, however, delayed progress on her cause, and it was not officially introduced in Rome until 1940. Just when Seton's cause began to advance at the Holy See, however, a more serious obstacle arose when the Sacred Congregation of Rites, at the urging of Philadelphia's Cardinal Denis Dougherty, appointed an imperious Vincentian priest to serve as Seton's vice-postulator. His long-running feud with Seton's spiritual daughters required repeated diplomatic interventions from Amleto Cicognani, New York's Cardinal Francis Spellman, and eventually from the Holy See, as the members of Seton's congregation maintained that they, not their clerical proxy, should be recognized as the primary arbiters of Seton's afterlife. According to a canon lawyer charged by Spellman to investigate the matter in 1948, the conflict "threatened to silence" Seton's cause forever.[52] In the end, it was only the death of the priest that allowed the cause to move forward, paving the way for Seton's canonization in 1975—almost a century after her cause had first been proposed.[53]

John Neumann, who had also emerged as a candidate for canonization in the 1880s, was canonized two years after Seton. The pace of U.S. canonizations would quicken after that, in part because Pope John Paul II streamlined the saint-making procedures, famously permitting him to canonize an astonishing 482 people. (Only two of these, as it happens, had a U.S. connection: Katharine Drexel and Philippine Duchesne.)[54] Though the new norms did not include any prohibition against women serving as petitioners, the fact that Catholic women had for so long been obliged to work through male mediators, not only in causes for canonization but in all official business at the Holy See, has historiographical implications. In seeking to recover the importance of Rome in histories of the U.S. church, scholars run the serious risk of overemphasizing the bishops, cardinals, and priests who actually went there, to the near exclusion of not only women but also the majority of the Catholic faithful.

---

52. "Rev. Damien J. Blaher, O.F.M., to His Eminence Cardinal Spellman Pro Memoria on the Cause of Elizabeth Ann Seton," September 7, 1948, S/C-71, Folder 5, Archives of the Archdiocese of New York, Yonkers, NY.

53. For an account of this conflict, see chapter 4 of my forthcoming *Citizen Saints* (Chapel Hill, 2019).

54. For more information on Drexel's and Duchesne's causes for canonization, as well as John Paul II's approach to naming saints, see chapter 6 of my forthcoming *Citizen Saints* (Chapel Hill, 2019).

As a new generation of historians seeks to rediscover the Catholic past, the questions they ask of it reflect their experience of an increasingly interconnected world and an understanding of the Church as "the world's most successful global institution."[55] At the same time, these scholars are indelibly influenced not only by the advances in social history that galvanized Dolan, but also by the rich body of scholarship that has appeared in the three decades since he published *The American Catholic Experience*, much of it focused on the religious practices of women and members of other understudied groups. The insights generated by what Thomas Tweed has called the "quotidian turn" in American religious history—the preponderance of studies that consider ordinary people in everyday life—pose an important question to those who would argue for a greater emphasis on the Holy See and its representatives throughout the world. Is it possible to write narratives that acknowledge the Church's institutional structures at the diocesan, national, and Vatican levels, and incorporate as subjects the ordinary Catholics who did not exercise visible power within those structures? Tweed offered a compelling model for such scholarship in *America's Church*, in which he used the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception in Washington, D.C. "as a vantage from which to combine the insights generated by the quotidian turn and the fruits of the scholarship that preceded it."[56] Leslie Woodcock Tentler's brilliant *Catholics and Contraception* offers another model for merging the perspectives of institutional elites and the people in the pews, and for juxtaposing ecclesiastical and secular spaces.[57]

The life and afterlife of the first U.S. citizen saint also suggests possibilities for crafting historical narratives that both foreground Rome and attend to the daily experience of ordinary Catholics. Cabrini may have been exceptional in many ways, but she was typical of many Catholic men and women religious who grasped that their mission extended beyond national boundaries, even if they spent their lives within U.S. borders. Cabrini shared far more in common with a Missionary Sister of the Sacred

---

55. David A. Bell, "This is What Happens When Historians Overuse the Idea of the Network," *The New Republic*, October 25, 2013. Retrieved September 22, 2017 from https://newrepublic.com/article/114709/world-connecting-reviewed-historians-overuse-network-metaphor.

56. Thomas A. Tweed, *America's Church: The National Shrine and Catholic Presence in the Nation's Capital* (Oxford, 2011); Tweed, "Catholic Studies after the Quotidian Turn: A Response," *American Catholic Studies,* vol. 122, no. 4 (2011): 82–7, here 83. Tweed, "After the Quotidian Turn: Interpretive Categories and Scholarly Trajectories in the Study of Religion since the 1960s," *The Journal of Religion,* vol. 95, no. 3 (2015), 361–85, here 379, 384.

57. Leslie Woodcock Tentler, *Catholics and Contraception: An American History* (Ithaca, NY, 2004).

Heart in Buenos Aires or London or Rome than she did with her neighbor in Chicago, Jane Addams, and she envisioned herself neither as "*una grande italiana*" nor as a citizen of the United States, but as a citizen of a world that was much "too small" to contain her religious zeal. As Mother Antonietta's map shows, Cabrini did physically return to Rome multiple times between 1888 and 1912. But what the map cannot capture are the metaphorical pathways Cabrini followed to Rome in her life of prayer and practice. Such roads were also open to many of the U.S. Catholic faithful, even those who were not members of global religious organizations. They also regularly journeyed to Rome, when they professed loyalty to the pope, or when they joined the effort to open a shrine in the nation's capital, or when they nominated one of their own for the church's highest honor. Rome came home to them, too, when they measured papal pronouncements in the context of their everyday choices, or celebrated wildly when the Holy See confirmed, at last, that a U.S. citizen had indeed become a citizen of heaven.

It may not be feasible for all researchers to "go themselves to Rome" and mine the rich archival sources available in the Vatican archives and throughout the Eternal City. Even so, by tracing the myriad ways in which ordinary U.S. Catholics mapped their relationships to the Holy See, the present generation of historians can "rediscover the past in a new and enlightening manner," and develop creative approaches that transcend categorical binaries of ecclesiastical and lived religious history.